evel 1, 251 St Georges Tce, Perth WA

PS ref: 8599 Shire ref: PA24/169

14 June 2024

Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale 6 Paterson Street MUNDIJONG WA 6123

Attention: Marius Le Grange, Statutory Town Planning Coordinator

Dear Marius,

LOT 10 (777) SOUTH WESTERN HIGHWAY, BYFORD PROPOSED SELF STORE FACILITY RESPONSE TO REASONS FOR REFUSAL

Planning Solutions acts on behalf of the proponent of the proposed self-storage facility on the land identified as Lot 10 (777) South Western Highway, Byford (**subject site**). An Application for Development Approval was lodged with the Shire of Serpentine Jarrahdale (**Shire**) on 2 April 2024. A response to a Request for Further Information (**RFI**) and summary of public submissions was lodged on 8 May 2024.

Despite working collaboratively with the Shire and responding to all matters raised during the assessment, we are disappointed to receive notice that the Shire is intending to recommend the development be refused. A detailed summary of the reasons for refusal was received via email correspondence on 5 June 2024.

In response to the matters raised, as well as feedback received during on-going discussions with Shire's officers, we are pleased to provide the following additional information in support of the development application:

- 1. Written response to the Shire's reasons for refusal and Byford Detailed Area Plan (refer submission below).
- 2. Amended development plans (refer **Attachment 1**).
- 3. Landscaping Plan (refer Attachment 2).
- 4. Revised Transport Impact Statement (refer **Attachment 3**).
- 5. Environmental Noise Technical Note (refer Attachment 4).
- 6. Revised Stormwater management Plan (refer **Attachment 5**).

SUMMARY OF AMENDMENTS

In response to the matters raised, the development plans have been broadly amended to reduce the overall bulk and scale, improve the materiality and street interface, as well as significantly increase the amount of landscaping on site. Specifically, the development plans have been amended to:

- Modify the form of the development from a vertical multi-storey building into a horizontal single storey layout. As a result, the development now comprises:
 - o A maximum height of 5.05m. It is noted that due to site levels, the height as viewed from South Western Highway will be significantly less.
 - A reduction in units to 375, with an average size of 10.9m².

- A reduction in total site coverage to 47%.
- A revised setback of:
 - 1.2m from George Street.
 - Between 10.2m and 0.3m from the northern boundary.
 - Between 7.8m and 2.8m from the southern boundary.
 - Between 10.2m and 1.5m from South Western Highway.
- Subsequent reconfiguration of the internal access ways and parking areas. As a result, the development now comprises a north-south orientation and 169.5m of parking/loading zones, providing parking for 31 standard vehicles. No modifications to the crossover locations are proposed.
- Remove the fire tanks and relocate the pylon sign north, out of the proposed road widening area.
- Relocate the bin store to the south western portion of the development (at 21m²) and the office/box shop and toilet (at 40m²) to the north western portion of the site.
- Significantly increase the amount of landscaping on site. The development now proposes 868m² of landscaping (10% of the total site area).
- Improve the materiality of the development with the use of Portland and painted precast concrete, perforated mesh screening, feature corrugated cladding panels, and powder coated metal framing along the South Western Highway elevation, forming vertical articulation. The colour palette has been amended to a mix of grey as well as eucalyptus and forest green, in accordance with the prevailing natural and rural character of the locality.

Refer **Attachment 1**, revised development plans, **Attachment 2**, landscaping plan, and **Attachment 3**, revised Transport Impact Statement.

Refer Figures 1-3 below, revised development perspectives.



Perspective 1 – Development as viewed from George Street.



Perspective 2 – Development as viewed from South Western Highway.



Perspective 3 – Development as viewed from South Western Highway.

RESPONSE TO SHIRE'S REASONS FOR REFUSAL

A written response to the Shire's reasons for refusal, as detailed in their email dated 5 June 2024 is provided in **Table 1** below.

Table 1 - Response to Shire's Reasons for Refusal

Shire Comment

Applicant Response

The proposed development is not considered to represent a form of physical works that protect current amenity, nor align with the intended future amenity for the service commercial zone, as documented under Local Planning Scheme 3

Due to the trafficable areas within the site required for circulation, it is acknowledged that less area may be available for soft landscaping. In balancing the scale and extent of built form proposed, versus the development standards set for the service commercial zone, it is considered that a reduction in landscaping is not appropriate, justifiable or reflective of orderly and proper planning.

The development plans have been amended to increase the amount of landscaping to 868m² (10% of the site area), in accordance with the provisions of LPS2.

Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans.

In addition, a landscaping plan has now been prepared, providing greater clarity and detail on the landscaping proposed on site. This includes the use of endemic species.

Refer Attachment 2, landscaping plan.

A reduction in landscaping, to the extent proposed (120sqm), removes the possibility for a consistent treated landscaped edge along South Western Highway. For a building of the size proposed (10.6m), Officers consider that a consistent landscaping strip with capacity to accommodate advanced landscaping (4m to 6m wide), is an expectation of the planning framework and broader policy suites governing design of the building environment

A consistent landscaping strip is proposed along the length of the South Western Highway boundary. The strip is between 1.5m and 10.2m and is in addition to the landscaping strip along the South Western Highway verge, providing an additional 8m.

Refer Attachment 2, landscaping plan.

The proposed development does not demonstrate that it will be consistent with the orderly and proper planning of the locality, having regard for the Byford Townsite Local Development Plan and the development principles it establishes for new development

Buildings must present a quality visual aspect to all street frontages. The main entry must be visually prominent, and clear views must be provided from the development to all adjacent streets.

The development plans have been amended to modify the form of the development from a vertical multi-storey building into a horizontal single storey layout. This reduces the perceived bulk and scale.

The respective street frontages comprise a materiality of use of Portland and painted precast concrete, perforated mesh screening, feature corrugated cladding panels, and powder coated metal framing along the South Western Highway elevation, forming vertical articulation. The colour palette has been amended to a mix of grey as well as eucalyptus and forest green, in accordance with the prevailing natural and rural character of the locality.

Further, the roof along the South Western Highway frontage has been designed to pitch up to the respective corners, in accordance with the prevailing pitched roof form of the locality. Internal roofs are flat, noting they will not be visible externally. Due to site levels, the buildings will appear lower when viewed from South Western Highway.

Openings to George Street are maintained via the crossovers. It is noted that despite minimal openings to South Western Highway, the development is a low traffic use, and as such, additional openings have no benefit to passive surveillance to the street. As such, additional focus has been paced on ensuring the respective frontages are visually appealing.

Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans.

Shire Comment Applicant Response Ground floors shall have walls with large glazed areas facing The development comprises self storage units. With the the street, and any other areas facing significant setbacks exception of the office/box store, the units cannot be glazed. should also have glazed areas to enhance their commercial exposure and maximise casual surveillance both into and out This is due to security and privacy reasons. of the building Roof forms shall be broken up to add interest to the skyline. The development plans have been amended to reduce the Reflective roofing materials are not permitted (unless the roof building height to a single storey. The roof along the South is flat located behind a pediment). Roofing profiles and Western Highway frontage has been designed to pitch up to formats will be considered in their overall street context and the respective corners, in accordance with the prevailing should contribute visually to the context of the immediate pitched roof form of the locality. Internal roofs are flat, noting vicinity. Bearing in mind the semi-rural character of the town, they will not be visible externally. pitched roofs shall be set at approximately 25 degrees. Buildings should be capable of adaptation over time to cater The development comprises self storage units. By virtue, this for alternative uses type of development form <u>cannot be made to be adaptive</u>. Development may be permitted to a maximum of two storeys, The development plans have been amended to reduce the with a total roof height of 8.0m maximum building height to a single storey. New buildings shall be constructed predominantly of brick / Due to existing economic conditions, including the high cost masonry - either rendered or unrendered, with metal (nonof labour and materials, the development continues to reflective) roofing. The use of some weatherboard cladding or predominately propose concrete tilt up construction. custom orb profile steel sheeting as a detail feature should Notwithstanding, the materiality of the respective street also be considered, in combination with the brick / masonry. frontages comprise a materiality of use of Portland and The use of concrete tilt-up construction for external walls will painted precast concrete, perforated mesh screening, feature only be permitted if the developer can demonstrate that corrugated cladding panels, and powder coated metal framing along the South Western Highway elevation, forming vertical proposed articulation, detailing and the provision of windows is compatible with the objectives and provisions of these articulation. The colour palette has been amended to a mix of guidelines. Acceptable means of treating tilt-up slabs include grey as well as eucalyptus and forest green, in accordance with detailing by texturing / grooving surfaces, by the use of basthe prevailing natural and rural character of the locality. relief designs or public artworks, and the inclusion of brick Further, the roof along the South Western Highway frontage headers around windows and doors. Other design devices to accentuate openings may be considered has been designed to pitch up to the respective corners, in accordance with the prevailing pitched roof form of the locality. Internal roofs are flat, noting they will not be visible externally. Due to site levels, the buildings will appear lower when viewed from South Western Highway. Openings to George Street are maintained via the crossovers. It is noted that despite minimal openings to South Western Highway, the development is a low traffic use, and as such, additional openings have no benefit to passive surveillance to the street. As such, additional focus has been paced on ensuring the respective frontages are visually appealing. Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans. Commercial property owners or tenants should not use The colour palette has been amended to a mix of grey as well colours that make their buildings stand in sharp contrast to as eucalyptus and forest green, in accordance with the their context. Intense and lurid colours shall not be used. prevailing natural and rural character of the locality. o Muted neutral backgrounds with mid-range accents are acceptable. Occasional and limited use of strong colour could Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans. add life to the streetscape, but strong colour use should be the exception rather than the primary colour. o Colours that take inspiration from the local soils and vegetation would be most appropriate.

Shire Comment

Applicant Response

The proposed development is not considered to provide sufficient layout and configuration to encompass the minimum landscaping required, which is necessary to help moderate the physical form of development especially as viewed from public areas

There is a lack of visual appeal associated with the development. The facade treatment, while attempting some colour variation, architectural lines and material diversity, does not represent a form of development which responds or enhances the distinctive characteristics of the setting which is Byford. The building is large and industrial in its scale, with a physical presence that is not matched sensitively to its landscape setting.

There is a lack of responsiveness to the local context and character of Byford, and the setting of the foothills of the Darling Scarp. The existing feelings towards built form often engender the town having a semi-rural feel, with strong visual connections to the Darling Scarp. This contracts with the very urban and industrial appearance currently depicted by the development.

There is concern that material and colour choices, do not sufficiently represent and be of the landscape of Byford. Colour, texture, form and materials should be selected based on the study of the local character and the unique environment, to create a design that identifies the site character and works within the context in which it sits. Officers do not consider that the current design does this. Whereas materials like the Cardup brick, natural timber and laterite stone set within reassuring styles of architecture help to moderate development with the semi-rural built form, this is not proposed in the application before Officers

The architectural style of new buildings, in applying SPP7.0, should reinforce the contemporary rural town feel that is Byford. This is not done in this case. This should be done through applying styling which is simple and contemporary, referencing on the simple forms and styling of traditional rural architecture

As a large building which is inconsistent with context and character, but set on the main gateway of Byford, it has the potential to disrupt visual harmony especially in the ongoing attempt to unify styles and expectations between the old and new parts of Byford. This will from a sense of place otherwise intended by harmonising new development fronts, in practical sense, with the older historical Byford townsite

The development is considered to be at odds with good human scale and experience, especially in its disruption of vistas to and from the Darling Scarp. Whereas the predominant built form of Byford has continued mostly single and two story construction, that affords a deep connection with the Scarp, having a three story high building in this location is considered inappropriate. Such bulk does not coherently form or announce a key point on the landscape, and will be vastly different in experience compared to all other aspects of the locality surrounding. It could, for example, represent a very intrusive element, by not moderating its form and impact more sustainably to the landscape it is proposed on.

The South Western Highway Precinct encompasses the land area that was the Byford Town Centre before the

The development plans have been amended to modify the form of the development from a vertical multi-storey building into a horizontal single storey layout. This reduces the perceived bulk and scale.

The materiality of the respective street frontages comprise a materiality of use of Portland and painted precast concrete, perforated mesh screening, feature corrugated cladding panels, and powder coated metal framing along the South Western Highway elevation, forming vertical articulation. The colour palette has been amended to a mix of grey as well as eucalyptus and forest green, in accordance with the prevailing natural and rural character of the locality.

Further, the roof along the South Western Highway frontage has been designed to pitch up to the respective corners, in accordance with the prevailing pitched roof form of the locality. Internal roofs are flat, noting they will not be visible externally. Due to site levels, the buildings will appear lower when viewed from South Western Highway.

Openings to George Street are maintained via the crossovers. It is noted that despite minimal openings to South Western Highway, the development is a low traffic use, and as such, additional openings have no benefit to passive surveillance to the street. As such, additional focus has been paced on ensuring the respective frontages are visually appealing.

Refer **Attachment 1**, revised development plans and **Attachment 2**, landscaping plans.

Shire Comment Applicant Response redevelopment of the area on the western side of the railway. Leading into the town centre, development would slowly graduate up in intensity, but still remain connected with both rural function and purpose. Whereas the expressed zoning for service commercial intends for development patterns to intensify, the manner proposed by this development is not considered to enable acceptable forms of building transitioning between the broader residential areas to the north and east, and the Byford Town Centre to the south. As mentioned previously, the physically prominent built form The development plans have been amended to increase the does not provide the required level of landscaping, and thus amount of landscaping to 868m² (10% of the site area), in reduces the ability for landscaping to help moderate the accordance with the provisions of LPS2. physical works. Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans. In addition, a landscaping plan has now been prepared, providing greater clarity and detail on the landscaping proposed on site. This includes the use of endemic species. Refer Attachment 2, landscaping plan.

The proposed development does not include sufficient information to determine whether it will be able to manage noise impacts, on the basis that no environmental noise assessment has been provided. Being a 24 / 7 operation, there is insufficient information to determine if noise impacts can be managed

The proposal has not provided an Environmental Noise Assessment as part of the application. The proposal's nature is not considered to generate noise that will be of an intrusive nature during daytime hours. Given the proposal does intend to operate on a 24/7 basis with a secure access gate, there is risk that the proposal will cause undue noise emissions if patrons are accessing the facility during the night. This is a further issue that Officers consider warrants recommending refusal

As part of the response to the RFI, the Shire agreed that a Noise Management Plan will be conditioned as part of the development approval.

Notwithstanding, a Noise Assessment technical note has been prepared addressing the matters raised and continues to confirm the suitability of the development from a stormwater perspective.

Refer **Attachment 4**, Noise Management Technical Note.

The proposed development does not demonstrate the ability to manage stormwater

Officers do not support the stormwater management plan, on the basis that it does not suitably depict how sufficient onsite storage for the management of post development flows, to not exceed predevelopment flows, will occur. The current plan does not include details such as discharge rates of stormwater, or demonstration that the storage requirement for rainfall events can cater for a 1% AEP (annual exceedance probability). This lack of information means Officers are unwilling to recommend a condition to require a plan be provided, given such could warrant substantive changes to the design proposed.

This matter was not raised by the Shire during its assessment.

Notwithstanding, the projects engineer liaised with the Shire to discuss the matters raised. A response to the matters raised is provided in **Attachment 5**, Stormwater Technical Note.

BYFORD TOWN CENTRE DETAILED AREA PLAN ASSESSMENT

The Byford Town Centre Detailed Area Plan (**DAP**) was originally published in 2004. Despite being superseded by the provisions of Shire's Local Planning Scheme No. 2, draft Local Planning Scheme no. 3, and the Byford District Structure Plan, an assessment against the relevant provisions is provided in **Table 2** below.

Pursuant to the DAP, the subject site is within Precinct H - Highway Commercial.

should contribute visually to the context of the

approx. 25 degrees.

immediate vicinity. Bearing in mind the semi-rural

character of the town, pitched roofs shall be set at

Table 2 - Response to Shire's Reasons for Refusal **Shire Comment Applicant Response** The development comprises self storage units - a form **Characteristics** These areas, extending both north and south of the Central entirely compatible with the aforementioned uses. Core Area, are proposed to accommodate showrooms, bulky goods, offices, medical centres, consulting rooms, and the like. **Building Setbacks** Setback shave been superseded by the provisions of DPS2. South Western Highway - 15m from the kerb of the Notwithstanding, as a result of the modifications to the South Western Highway carriageway. building form, the development is now setback: All other setbacks - to be determined by the Shire. 1.2m from George Street. Between 10.2m and 0.3m from the northern boundary. Between 7.8m and 2.8m from the southern boundary. Between 10.2m and 1.5m from South Western Pursuant to the provisions of Development Control Policy 5.1, **Orientation and Frontages** North of the Central Core new development must no access can be provided via South Western Highway. As address the Highway, George Street, car parking and such, this boundary forms the 'rear' of the site. public footpath. The development plans have been amended to modify the In both Areas buildings must present a quality visual form of the development from a vertical multi-storey building aspect to all street frontages. The main entry must into a horizontal single storey layout. This reduces the be visually prominent, and clear views must be perceived bulk and scale. provided from the development to all adjacent streets. Notwithstanding, the development continues to address both Ground floors shall have walls with large glazed frontages via articulation, changes in materiality, openings, areas facing the street, and any other areas facing and roof pitch. Refer additional comments below. significant setbacks should also have glazed areas to enhance their commercial exposure and maximise Openings to George Street are maintained via the crossovers. casual surveillance both into and out of the It is noted that despite minimal openings to South Western building; Highway, the development is a low traffic use, and as such, additional openings have no benefit to passive surveillance to the street. As such, additional focus has been paced on ensuring the respective frontages are visually appealing. The development comprises self storage units. With the exception of the office/box store, the units cannot be glazed. This is due to security and privacy reasons. Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans and Attachment 2, landscaping plans. Scale and Built Form The development plans have been amended to modify the While new development may be contemporary in form of the development from a vertical multi-storey building into a horizontal single storey layout. This reduces the its form and style, it shall also strive to demonstrate perceived bulk and scale. some consistency with the best elements of neighbouring contemporary buildings (if they exist) Due to existing economic conditions, including the high cost in terms of basic form, rhythm, materials and of labour and materials, the development continues to articulation; predominately propose concrete tilt up construction. Roof forms shall be broken up to add interest to the skyline. Reflective roofing materials are not Notwithstanding, the materiality of the respective street permitted (unless the roof is flat located behind a frontages comprise a materiality of use of Portland and pediment). Roofing profiles and formats will be painted precast concrete, perforated mesh screening, feature considered in their overall street context, and corrugated cladding panels, and powder coated metal framing

along the South Western Highway elevation, forming vertical

articulation. The colour palette has been amended to a mix of

Shire Comment

- Buildings should be capable of adaptation over time to cater for alternative uses;
- Development may be permitted to a maximum of two storeys, with a total roof height of 8.0m maximum.

Building Materials and Colours

New buildings shall be constructed predominantly of brick / masonry - either rendered or unrendered, with metal (non-reflective) roofing. The use of some weatherboard cladding or custom orb profile steel sheeting as a detail feature should also be considered, in combination with the brick /

Where roofing is visible, large profile roof sheeting is not acceptable.

The use of concrete tilt-up construction for external walls will only be permitted if the developer can demonstrate that proposed articulation, detailing and the provision of windows is compatible with the objectives and provisions of these Guidelines. Acceptable means of treating tilt-up slabs include detailing by texturing / grooving surfaces, by the use of bas-relief designs or public artworks, and the inclusion of brick headers around windows and doors. Other design devices to accentuate openings may be considered.

- Commercial property owners or tenants should not use colours that make their buildings stand in sharp contrast to their context. Intense and lurid colours shall not be used.
- Muted neutral backgrounds with mid-range accents are acceptable. Occasional and limited use of strong colour could add life to the streetscape, but strong colour use should be the exception rather than the rule.
- Colours that take inspiration from the local soils and vegetation would be most appropriate.

Applicant Response

grey as well as eucalyptus and forest green, in accordance with the prevailing natural and rural character of the locality.

Further, the roof along the South Western Highway frontage has been designed to pitch up to the respective corners, in accordance with the prevailing pitched roof form of the locality. Internal roofs are flat, noting they will not be visible externally. Due to site levels, the buildings will appear lower when viewed from South Western Highway.

Openings to George Street are maintained via the crossovers. It is noted that despite minimal openings to South Western Highway, the development is a low traffic use, and as such, additional openings have no benefit to passive surveillance to the street. As such, additional focus has been paced on ensuring the respective frontages are visually appealing.

The development comprises self storage units. By virtue, this type of development form cannot be made to be adaptive.

Refer Attachment 1, revised development plans and Attachment 2, landscaping plans.

Fencing

Fencing will not be permitted in the Highway Commercial area. Where screening of service areas is required, it shall be constructed of materials consistent with the building it services

Due to security reasons, the development proposes fencing along the Soth Western Highway elevation.

The fencing is permeable and is surrounded by dense landscaping, ensuring the fencing blends into its setting.

All servicing areas are hidden from public view.

Servicing

- Service areas shall be located out of sight of public roads and footpaths.
- Air conditioning equipment, satellite dishes and other roof structures shall be located so as not to extend above the roof line
- Mechanical equipment may be permitted on building facades (other than a public street façade) where it is adequately visually screened and noiseinsulated in a manner that is in keeping with the development

Advertising Sings

Advertising signage must conform to the requirements of the Shire of Serpentine-Jarrahdale Local Planning Policy No. 5 - "Control of

All signage remains compliant with the local planning framework.

The proposed pylon sign has been shifted north to avoid MRWA's road widening area.

Shire Comment Applicant Response Advertisements". However, the following signage types will be prohibited: Building signs above roof Building signs projecting Off-building signs pylon Off-building signs hoardings Tethered off-building signs Off-building signs product display Building signage shall be kept simple and restrained, and set on the building front as appropriate. Corner buildings may be treated differently where signage can be made an integral part of the design, and demonstrated to be visually compatible. Signage other than the name of the business, the principal activity of the business and the street address will not be permitted. 'Third party' advertising will not generally be permitted. Colours for signs should be selected with due consideration for the colours used in neighbouring developments. Signage should be located in places that are appropriate to the architecture, and be considered part of the overall building design. These provisions have been superseded by LPS2. Landscaping A landscape plan must be provided and approved Notwithstanding, the development plans have been amended by the Council for every development site. The plan to increase the amount of landscaping to 10% of the site area. must incorporate the planting of substantial trees, Refer Attachment 1. aimed at maintaining the area's semi-rural character. A minimum of 15% of the total site shall be In addition, a landscaping plan has now been prepared, providing greater clarity and detail on the landscaping landscaped in a form approved by the Council. This proposed on site. This includes the use of endemic species. area shall include any area on a secondary street frontage, and may include an open car park where Refer Attachment 2, landscaping plan. shade tree planting is proposed at a rate of at least one tree per 6 car bays. All trees planted on the site must be from a selected palette of indigenous trees as specified by the Council and listed below: o Eucalyptus lanepoolei

- Corymbia haematoxylon
- o Corymbia calophylla rosea
- o Eucalyptus todtiana
- o Eucalyptus wandoo
- o Melaleuca preisiana
- o Eucalyptus ficifolia
- o Eucalyptus marginata sp. elegantella
- Allocasaurina fraseriana
- o Eucalyptus rudis
- Callistemon sp. (as used on South-Western Highway)
- No planted strip shall be less than 1.5 m in width.
- All planting to be native with preference for indigenous species.
- Street trees to be provided, as required by Council, approximately every 10 metres. Species to be as required by Council.
- Exiting trees are to be maintained wherever possible.

CONCLUSION

We trust the information provided above, and enclosed, satisfactorily addresses the Shire's reasons for refusal as detailed in the letter dates 5 June 2024. The amendments to the development are in line with the feedback provided and is considered to provide a superior design outcome for the site.

Accordingly, we respectfully request the Shire's officers continue their assessment of the proposed development and recommend approval to the JDAP.

Should you have any queries or require further clarification in regard to the above matter please do not hesitate to contact the writer.

Yours faithfully,

SENIOR PLANNER

240613 8599 Response to reasons for refusal.docx